

Serial No. 10/806,618
Response to Office Action of 2/09/07
Page 2 of 6

RECEIVED
CENTRAL FAX CENTER

JUN 07 2007

REMARKS

Claims 1-6 are pending in this application. For the reasons set forth below, Applicants believe that the rejections should be withdrawn and that the claims are in condition for allowance.

I. Claim Rejections – 35 U.S.C. § 102(b)

The Examiner rejected Claims 1-6 under 35 U.S.C. 102(b) as being anticipated by Japanese Patent Application No. 2001-088430 to Ota ("Ota"). In order to anticipate a claim under 35 U.S.C. 102(b), a reference must disclose each and every element of a claim. As discussed below, this rejection is respectfully traversed.

Claim 1

With respect to Claim 1, Ota lacks one or more features of the claimed invention. Ota discloses an ink jet recording material capable of preventing bronzing, without reducing the lightfastness of a color. [0007]. The ink jet recording material may be comprised of a "film transparent or opaque as a base material." [0018]. The ink absorbing material may be comprised of one or more of benzotriazole system compounds. [0008-9]. Claim 1 requires "an interior ornament for a vehicle" that includes a base substrate, an ink-acceptance layer including benzotriazole series compounds and a printed layer.

Although Ota discloses an ink jet recording material comprised of benzotriazole compounds, it does not disclose or suggest anything that encompasses "an interior ornament for a vehicle" as recited in Claim 1. Ota does not disclose or suggest each and every element of the claimed invention as recited in Claim 1. None of the corresponding sections of the detailed description of Ota cited by the Examiner show otherwise. Thus Claim 1 is patentable over Ota and the rejection should be withdrawn.

Claim 4

With respect to Claim 4, Ota lacks one or more features of the claimed invention. Ota discloses an ink jet recording material capable of preventing bronzing, without reducing the lightfastness of a color. [0007]. The ink jet recording material may be comprised of a "film transparent or opaque as a base material." [0018]. The ink absorbing material may be

Serial No. 10/806,618

Response to Office Action of 2/09/07

Page 3 of 6

comprised of one or more of benzotriazole system compounds. [0008-9]. Claim 4 requires "an indicator panel for a vehicle" that includes a base substrate, an ink-acceptance layer including benzotriazole series compounds and a printed layer.

Although Ota discloses an ink jet recording material comprised of benzotriazole compounds, it does not disclose or suggest anything that encompasses "an indicator panel for a vehicle" as recited in Claim 4. Ota does not disclose or suggest each and every element of the claimed invention as recited in Claim 4. None of the corresponding sections of the detailed description of Ota cited by the Examiner show otherwise. Thus Claim 4 is patentable over Ota and the rejection should be withdrawn.

Claims 2, 3, 5, and 6

Claims 2, 3, 5, and 6 depend directly from independent Claims 1 and 4. Accordingly, for at least the same reasons discussed above, Claims 2, 3, 5, and 6 are patentable over Ota.

II. Claim Rejections – 35 U.S.C. § 103(a)

The Examiner rejected Claims 1-6 under 35 U.S.C. 102(b) as being unpatentable over U.S. Patent No. 5,977,219 to Ravichandran *et. al* ("Ravichandran") in view of Ota. For at least the following reasons, the Applicants respectfully traverse this rejection and request reconsideration and withdrawal thereof. The Examiner has not established a prima facie case of obviousness. To establish a prima facie case of obviousness, the Examiner must: (1) identify the reason why a person of ordinary skill in the art would have combined the teachings of the references; and (2) show that the references teach or suggest all of the claimed limitations.

Claim 1

As acknowledged by the Examiner, Ravichandran fails to disclose or suggest all of the limitations of Claim 1. Specifically, Ravichandran does not disclose the benzotriazole UV absorbers recited in Claim 1. Although Ravichandran discloses benzotriazole UV absorbers, the UV absorbers do not have the claimed properties. Ravichandran describes that the benzotriazole UV absorbers are incorporated into automotive coatings. [2:25-27].

Serial No. 10/806,618

Response to Office Action of 2/09/07

Page 4 of 6

Automotive coatings are those coatings commonly understood to be on the exterior of an automobile.

Ravichandran also discloses recording materials suitable for pressure-sensitive copying systems, photocopying systems using microcapsules, heat-sensitive copying systems, photographic materials and ink jet printing. [13:20-23]. Ravichandran discloses benzotriazole UV absorbers in an external coating on a vehicle or in recording materials.

The Examiner admitted that Ravichandran does not disclose the claimed benzotriazole UV absorbers, but alleged that Ota describes the claimed benzotriazole UV absorbers, and alleged that both references are directed to the prevention of bronzing. As described herein, neither Ravichandran nor Ota describe an "interior ornament" as recited by Claim 1. Even if the references are combined, the combination does not describe the invention of Claim 1 because neither reference describes an interior ornament for a vehicle.

Therefore, the Examiner has failed to show that Ravichandran in view of Ota teaches or suggest all of the elements of Claim 1. Thus Claim 1 is patentable over Ravichandran in view of Ota and the rejection should be withdrawn.

Claim 4

As acknowledged by the Examiner, Ravichandran fails to disclose or suggest all of the limitations of Claim 4. Specifically, Ravichandran does not disclose the benzotriazole UV absorbers recited in Claim 4. Although Ravichandran discloses benzotriazole UV absorbers, the benzotriazole UV absorbers do not have the claimed properties. Ravichandran describes that the benzotriazole UV absorbers are incorporated into automotive coatings. [2:25-27]. Automotive coatings are those coatings commonly understood to be on the exterior of an automobile.

Ravichandran also discloses recording materials suitable for pressure-sensitive copying systems, photocopying systems using microcapsules, heat-sensitive copying systems, photographic materials and ink jet printing. [13:20-23]. Ravichandran discloses benzotriazole UV absorbers in an external coating on a vehicle or in recording materials.

Serial No. 10/806,618

Response to Office Action of 2/09/07

Page 5 of 6

The Examiner admitted that Ravichandran does not disclose the claimed benzotriazole UV absorbers, but alleged that Ota describes the claimed benzotriazole UV absorbers, and alleged that both references are directed to the prevention of bronzing. As described herein, neither Ravichandran nor Ota describe an "indicator panel" as recited by Claim 4. Even if the references are combined, the combination does not describe the invention of Claim 4 because neither reference describes an indicator panel for a vehicle.

Therefore, the Examiner has failed to show that Ravichandran in view of Ota teaches or suggest all of the elements of Claim 4. Thus Claim 4 is patentable over Ravichandran in view of Ota and the rejection should be withdrawn.

Claims 2, 3, 5, and 6

Claims 2, 3, 5, and 6 depend directly from independent Claims 1 and 4. Accordingly, for at least the same reasons discussed above, Claims 2, 3, 5, and 6 are patentable over Ravichandran in view Ota.

Serial No. 10/806,618
Response to Office Action of 2/09/07
Page 6 of 6

RECEIVED
CENTRAL FAX CENTER
JUN 07 2007

CONCLUSION

The foregoing is submitted as a complete response to the Office Action identified above. This application should now be in condition for allowance, and the Applicants solicit a notice to that effect. If there are any issues that can be addressed via telephone, the Examiner is asked to contact the undersigned at 404.685.6799. the Commissioner is authorized to charge any additional fees that may be due or credit any overpayment to Deposit Account No. 11-0855.

Respectfully submitted,



By: Brenda O. Holmes
Reg. No. 40,339

KILPATRICK STOCKTON LLP
1100 Peachtree Street, Suite 2800
Atlanta, Georgia 30309-4530
Telephone: (404) 815-6500
Facsimile: (404) 815-6555